



## **Fluorescent light-emitting diode (LED) microscopy for diagnosis of tuberculosis**

**Policy statement**

## WHO Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Fluorescent light-emitting diode (LED) microscopy for diagnosis of tuberculosis: policy statement.

1.Tuberculosis - diagnosis. 2.Microscopy, Fluorescence - methods. 3.Lighting - instrumentation. 4.Developing countries. I.World Health Organization.

ISBN 978 92 4 150161 3

(NLM classification: WF 220)

**© World Health Organization 2011**

All rights reserved. Publications of the World Health Organization are available on [the WHO web site \(www.who.int\)](http://www.who.int) or can be purchased from WHO Press, World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (tel.: +41 22 791 3264; fax: +41 22 791 4857; e-mail: [bookorders@who.int](mailto:bookorders@who.int)).

Requests for permission to reproduce or translate WHO publications – whether for sale or for noncommercial distribution – should be addressed to WHO Press through the WHO web site ([http://www.who.int/about/licensing/copyright\\_form/en/index.html](http://www.who.int/about/licensing/copyright_form/en/index.html)).

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization be liable for damages arising from its use.

Printed by the WHO Document Production Services, Geneva, Switzerland

WHO/HTM/TB/2011.8

# Contents

## Abbreviations

Executive summary.....	3
1. Background.....	4
2. Evidence for policy formulation.....	4
2.1 Synthesis of evidence.....	4
2.2 Management of declarations of interest.....	5
3. Summary of results.....	5
4. Policy recommendations.....	6
5. Intended audience.....	7
6. References.....	7
7. Annexes.....	8
Annex 1: Expert Group members.....	8
Annex 2: WHO staff members.....	10
Annex 3: STAG-TB members.....	11

## Abbreviations

CI	confidence interval
GRADE	grades of recommendation assessment, development and evaluation
LED	light-emitting diode
STAG-TB	Strategic and Technical Advisory Group for Tuberculosis
TB	tuberculosis
WHO	World Health Organization

## **Executive summary**

Conventional light microscopy of Ziehl-Neelsen-stained smears prepared directly from sputum specimens is the most widely available test for diagnosis of tuberculosis (TB) in resource-limited settings. Ziehl-Neelsen microscopy is highly specific, but its sensitivity is variable (20–80%) and is significantly reduced in patients with extrapulmonary TB and in HIV-infected TB patients. Conventional fluorescence microscopy is more sensitive than Ziehl-Neelsen and takes less time, but its use has been limited by the high cost of mercury vapour light sources, the need for regular maintenance and the requirement for a dark room.

Light-emitting diodes (LED) have been developed to offer the benefits of fluorescence microscopy without the associated costs. In 2009, the evidence for the efficacy of LED microscopy was assessed by the World Health Organization (WHO), on the basis of standards appropriate for evaluating both the accuracy and the effect of new TB diagnostics on patients and public health. The results showed that the accuracy of LED microscopy was equivalent to that of international reference standards, it was more sensitive than conventional Ziehl-Neelsen microscopy and it had qualitative, operational and cost advantages over both conventional fluorescence and Ziehl-Neelsen microscopy.

On the basis of these findings, WHO recommends that conventional fluorescence microscopy be replaced by LED microscopy, and that LED microscopy be phased in as an alternative for conventional Ziehl-Neelsen light microscopy. The switch to LED microscopy should be carefully phased in at country level, with LED technology that meets WHO specifications. Countries using LED microscopy should train laboratory staff, validate the technique, introduce appropriate quality assurance and monitor the effect on TB case detection rates and treatment outcomes.

# Policy statement

## Fluorescent light-emitting diode (LED) microscopy for diagnosis of tuberculosis

### 1. Background

Direct sputum smear microscopy is the most widely used means for diagnosing pulmonary TB and is available in most primary health-care laboratories at health-centre level. Most laboratories use conventional light microscopy to examine Ziehl-Neelsen-stained direct smears; this has been shown to be highly specific in areas with a high prevalence of TB but with varying sensitivity (20–80%).

Fluorescence microscopy is more sensitive (10%) than conventional Ziehl-Neelsen microscopy, and examination of fluorochrome-stained smears takes less time. Uptake of fluorescence microscopy has, however, been limited by its high cost, due to expensive mercury vapour light sources, the need for regular maintenance and the requirement for a dark room.

LED microscopy was developed mainly to give resource-limited countries access to the benefits of fluorescence microscopy. First, existing fluorescence microscopes were converted to LED light sources. Considerable research and development subsequently resulted in inexpensive, robust LED microscopes or LED attachments for routine use in resource-limited settings.

In comparison with conventional mercury vapour fluorescence microscopes, LED microscopes are less expensive, require less power and can run on batteries; furthermore, the bulbs have a long half-life and do not pose the risk of releasing potentially toxic products if broken, and LED microscopes are reported to perform equally well in a light room. These qualities make LED microscopy feasible for use in resource-limited settings, bringing the benefits of fluorescence microscopy (improved sensitivity and efficiency) where they are needed most.

### 2. Evidence for policy formulation

#### 2.1 Synthesis of evidence

In September 2009, WHO assessed the evidence for the efficacy of LED microscopy in a systematic, structured way. The first step was a systematic review and meta-analysis of published and unpublished data with standard methods appropriate for studies of diagnostic accuracy. The second step was the convening of an expert group to evaluate the strength of the evidence, recommend operational and logistical considerations for use of LED microscopy in national TB control programmes and identify gaps to be addressed by future research. The third step was presentation of draft recommendations to the WHO Strategic and Technical Advisory Group for Tuberculosis (STAG-TB) for endorsement.

In accordance with current WHO standards for evidence assessment in the formulation of policy recommendations, the grades of recommendation assessment, development and evaluation (GRADE) system (1) was used by the Expert Group to assess the findings of the systematic review. This approach provides a systematic, structured framework for evaluating both the accuracy of new interventions and their impact on patients and public health.

The Expert Group's findings and the final GRADE evaluation (2) were presented to STAG-TB in November 2009. STAG-TB recognized that the evidence was compelling and that there was a large body of work on LED microscopy and advised WHO to proceed with policy guidance on its use (3). STAG-TB also asked WHO to prepare an overarching policy framework to guide the use of new TB diagnostics, methods and approaches at country level (3). This document provides a pragmatic summary of the evidence and recommendations for LED microscopy. It should be read

in conjunction with the detailed findings of the Expert Group (which include the GRADE tables) and the WHO framework for using TB diagnostics (2). The framework gives the context for use of one or more of the currently approved WHO diagnostic tools and methods in relation to country infrastructure, resources, TB epidemiology and TB policy reform.

The existing TB diagnostic tools are not mutually exclusive: they can be used in various combinations in country screening and diagnostic algorithms, which are highly setting- and resource-specific. Expert laboratory input is therefore needed to define the most cost-effective and efficient algorithms for individual countries, guided by WHO standards (e.g. for laboratory biosafety) and procedures and in the context of overall, integrated, laboratory strengthening.

## 2.2 Management of declarations of interest

Expert Group members were asked to submit completed declaration of interest forms, which were reviewed by the WHO secretariat before the Expert Group meeting. None of the members declared any conflict of interest. The declaration of interest statements were summarized by the co-chair of the Expert Group meeting at the start of the meeting. No additional declarations were made.

Selected individuals with intellectual or research involvement in LED microscopy were invited as observers to provide technical input and answer technical questions on the methods. These individuals did not participate in the GRADE evaluation and were asked to leave the meeting during the final discussions, when the recommendations were developed. They were also not involved in writing the final meeting report, nor in preparation of the STAG-TB documentation or the final WHO policy statements.

The process for evidence synthesis and policy development was reviewed by the WHO Guidelines Review Committee, and the policy recommendations were approved in June 2010.

The target date for review is 2015.

## 3. Summary of results

- *Accuracy of LED in comparison with reference standards:* LED microscopy showed 84% sensitivity (95% confidence interval [CI], 76–89%) and 98% specificity (95% CI, 85–97%) against culture as the reference standard. When a microscopic reference standard was used, the overall sensitivity was 93% (95% CI, 85–97%), and the overall specificity was 99% (95% CI, 98–99%). A significant increase in sensitivity was reported when direct smears were used rather than concentrated smears (89% and 73%, respectively).
- *Accuracy of LED in comparison with Ziehl-Neelsen microscopy:* LED microscopy was statistically significantly more sensitive by 6% (95% CI, 0.1–13%), with no appreciable loss in specificity, when compared with direct Ziehl-Neelsen microscopy.
- *Accuracy of LED in comparison with conventional fluorescence microscopy:* LED microscopy was 5% (95% CI, 0–11%) more sensitive and 1% (95% CI, -0.7% - 3%) more specific than conventional fluorescence microscopy.

In qualitative assessments of user characteristics and outcomes in relation to implementation, such as time to reading, cost-effectiveness, training and smear fading, the main findings were:

- In comparison with Ziehl-Neelsen, LED showed similar gains in time for reading as conventional fluorescence microscopy, with about half the time for smear examination.
- Cost assessments predict better cost-effectiveness with LED than with Ziehl-Neelsen microscopy, with improved efficiency.

- Qualitative assessments of LED microscopy confirmed many anticipated advantages, including use of the devices without a dark room, durability and portability (in the case of attachment devices); user acceptability in all field studies was reported as excellent.
- LED may be useful for diagnosing other diseases, e.g. malaria and trypanosomiasis, reducing the costs involved in providing integrated laboratory services.
- Possible barriers to widescale use of LED include training of laboratory staff unfamiliar with fluorescence microscopy and the fading of inherently unstable fluorochrome stains. Evidence from standardized training suggests that full proficiency in LED microscopy can be achieved within 1 month.
- Adequate evidence is available to recommend the use of auramine stains for LED microscopy. Other commercial and in-house fluorochrome stains are not recommended.
- Evidence on the effect of fading of fluorochrome stains on the reproducibility of smear results over time suggests that current external quality assurance programmes should be adapted.
- The introduction of LED might affect the cost of other diagnostic modalities, e.g. light microscopy for examining urine, stools and blood, which should be retained at peripheral health laboratory level.
- No studies were found on the direct effect of LED microscopy on outcomes important to patients, such as cure and treatment completion.
- Further research is required on the outcomes of LED microscopy that are important to patients and on combinations of LED microscopy with novel approaches for early case detection or sputum processing.

#### **4. Policy recommendations**

The GRADE process confirmed that there is sufficient generalizable evidence to recommend strongly the use of LED microscopy. WHO therefore recommends that:

- conventional fluorescence microscopy be replaced by LED microscopy with auramine staining in all settings where fluorescence microscopy is currently used;
- LED microscopy be phased in as an alternative to conventional Ziehl-Neelsen light microscopy in both high- and low-volume laboratories;
- the switch to LED microscopy be made according to a carefully phased implementation plan, with LED technology that meets WHO specifications;
- countries using LED microscopy address the following issues:
  - training requirements, especially for laboratory staff unfamiliar with fluorescence microscopy techniques;
  - country validation, i.e. demonstrating equivalent performance of LED with Ziehl-Neelsen or conventional fluorescence microscopy at country level during the introductory phase;
  - introduction of WHO-endorsed programmes for internal quality control and external quality assurance; and
  - monitoring of trends in TB case detection and treatment outcomes after introduction of LED microscopy.



WHO will assist countries in the use of LED microscopy by:

- preparing and disseminating technical specifications for LED devices to guide countries, technical and funding agencies in the purchase of high-quality equipment;
- preparing and disseminating standard operating procedures for LED microscopy;
- preparing and disseminating programmes for internal quality control and external quality assurance for LED microscopy; and
- facilitating, with partners and technical agencies, a coordinated approach to standardized training on LED microscopy at country level.

## **5. Intended audience**

This policy statement should be used to guide the use of LED microscopy for TB diagnosis in national TB control programmes. It is intended for use by national TB control programme managers and laboratory directors, in coordination with external laboratory consultants, donor agencies, technical advisors, laboratory technicians, laboratory equipment procurement officers, warehouse managers, other service providers, other relevant government officials and implementing partners involved in country-level TB laboratory strengthening. People responsible for programme planning, budgeting, resource mobilization and training for TB diagnostic services may also benefit from reading this document.

## **6. References**

1. <http://www.gradeworkinggroup.org>
2. [http://www.who.int/tb/laboratory/policy\\_statements/en/index.html](http://www.who.int/tb/laboratory/policy_statements/en/index.html)
3. [http://www.who.int/tb/advisory\\_bodies/stag/en/index.html](http://www.who.int/tb/advisory_bodies/stag/en/index.html)

## 7. Annexes

### Annex 1: Expert Group Members

#### **Dr Maryline Bonnet**

Epicentre, c/o MSFCH  
78 Rue de Lausanne  
116 - CH, 1211 Geneve  
Switzerland  
e-mail: [maryline.bonnet@geneva.msf.org](mailto:maryline.bonnet@geneva.msf.org)

#### **Dr Saidi Egwaga**

National TB/Leprosy Programme  
Ministry of Health, TB/Leprosy Unit  
PO Box 9083  
Dar Es Salaam  
Tanzania  
e-mail: [tantci@intafrica.com](mailto:tantci@intafrica.com)

#### **Dr Bernard Fourie**

Chief Scientific Officer and Director of South African Operations  
Medicine in Need Inc. USA and Medicine in Need South Africa (Pty) Ltd  
PO Box 12660, Queenswood 0121  
Pretoria  
South Africa  
e-mail: [bfourie@medicineinneed.org](mailto:bfourie@medicineinneed.org)

#### **Dr Christy Hanson**

Chair of STP Retooling Task Force  
US Agency for International Development (USAID), USAID/BGH/HIDN/ID  
3.7.23, 3rd Floor, Ronald Reagan Bldg  
20523-5900 - Washington, DC  
USA  
e-mail: [chanson@usaid.gov](mailto:chanson@usaid.gov)

#### **Dr Moses Joloba**

Head of National TB Reference Laboratory  
Department of Medical Microbiology  
Microbiology-Pathology Building  
Uganda  
e-mail: [moses.joloba@case.edu](mailto:moses.joloba@case.edu)

#### **Dr Marija Joncevska**

Regional laboratory specialist  
Project HOPE Central Asia  
162 Kunaeva st.  
050010 Almaty  
Kazakhstan  
e-mail: [mjoncevska@projecthope.kz](mailto:mjoncevska@projecthope.kz)

#### **Prof Paul R Klatser**

Co-Chair of Subgroup on Optimizing Smear Microscopy, STP New Diagnostics Working Group  
Head of Department  
KIT Biomedical Research  
Royal Tropical Institute  
Meibergdreef 39  
1105 AZ Amsterdam  
The Netherlands  
e-mail: [p.klatser@kit.nl](mailto:p.klatser@kit.nl)

#### **Dr Madhukar Pai**

Co-Chair of Subgroup on Evidence Synthesis for TB Diagnostics, STP New Diagnostics Working Group  
Assistant Professor  
Department of Epidemiology, Biostatistics & Occupational Health  
McGill University  
1020 Pine Avenue West  
Montreal, H3A 1A2  
Canada  
e-mail: [madhukar.pai@mcgill.ca](mailto:madhukar.pai@mcgill.ca)

#### **Dr John Ridderhof**

Chair of STP Global Laboratory Initiative Working Group  
Associate Director for Laboratory Science  
National Center for Preparedness, Detection and Control of Infectious Diseases, CCID  
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention  
1600 Clifton Rd NE,  
MS-C12  
Atlanta, Georgia 30333  
USA  
e-mail: [jridderhof@cdc.gov](mailto:jridderhof@cdc.gov)

#### **Dr Bertie Squire**

Co-Chair of Subgroup on TB Diagnostics and Poverty, STP New Diagnostics Working Group  
Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine  
Pembroke Place  
Liverpool  
UNITED KINGDOM  
e-mail: [s.b.squire@liverpool.ac.uk](mailto:s.b.squire@liverpool.ac.uk)

**Dr Karen Steingart**

Francis J. Curry National Tuberculosis  
Center  
University of California, San Francisco  
3180 18th Street, Suite 101  
San Francisco, CA 94110-2028  
USA  
e-mail: [karenst@u.washington.edu](mailto:karenst@u.washington.edu)

**Mr Javid Syed**

TB/HIV Project Director  
Treatment Action Group  
611 Broadway, Suite 308  
New York, NY 10012  
USA  
e-mail:  
[javid.syed@treatmentactiongroup.org](mailto:javid.syed@treatmentactiongroup.org)

**Dr Armand van Deun**

Bacteriology Consultant  
International Union Against Tuberculosis  
and Lung Disease  
Mycobacteriology Unit  
Institute of Tropical Medicine  
Nationalestraat 155  
B-2000 - Antwerpen  
Belgium  
e-mail: [avandeun@iuatld.org](mailto:avandeun@iuatld.org)

**Dr Adithya Cattamanchi**

Assistant Professor of Medicine  
San Francisco General Hospital  
Division of Pulmonary and Critical Care  
Medicine  
Room 5K1  
1001 Potrero Avenue  
San Francisco, California 94110  
Email: [acattamanchi@medsfgh.ucsf.edu](mailto:acattamanchi@medsfgh.ucsf.edu)

**Dr Jessica Minion**

Medical Microbiology  
MSC Epidemiology  
McGill University  
1020 Pine Avenue West  
Montreal, H3A 1A2  
Canada  
Email: [jessica.minion@mail.mcgill.ca](mailto:jessica.minion@mail.mcgill.ca)

**Dr Catharina Boehme**

Foundation for Innovative New Diagnostics  
(FIND)  
71 Avenue Louis-Casai  
1216 Geneva  
Switzerland  
e-mail:  
[catharina.boehme@finddiagnostics.org](mailto:catharina.boehme@finddiagnostics.org)

**Dr C N Paramasivan**

Foundation for Innovative New Diagnostics  
(FIND)  
71 Avenue Louis-Casai  
1216 Geneva  
Switzerland  
e-mail:  
[CN.paramasivan@finddiagnostics.org](mailto:CN.paramasivan@finddiagnostics.org)

**Dr Eric Adam**

Foundation for Innovative New Diagnostics  
(FIND)  
71 Avenue Louis-Casai  
1216 Geneva  
Switzerland  
email: [eric.adam@finddiagnostics.org](mailto:eric.adam@finddiagnostics.org)

**Dr Richard Bumgarner**

Independent Consultant  
Health Economics and Finance  
Program and Institutional Evaluations  
Tuberculosis Control Adviser  
1715 Abbey Oak Drive  
Vienna, VA 22182  
USA  
e-mail: [richardbumgarner@gmail.com](mailto:richardbumgarner@gmail.com)

## Annex 2 : WHO staff members

Leopold Blanc: [blancl@who.int](mailto:blancl@who.int)  
Jean Iragena: [iragenaj@who.int](mailto:iragenaj@who.int)  
Paul Nunn: [nunnp@who.int](mailto:nunnp@who.int)  
Karin Weyer: [weyerk@who.int](mailto:weyerk@who.int)  
Matteo Zignol: [zignolm@who.int](mailto:zignolm@who.int)

### **WHO-TDR**

L Cuevas: [cuevasl@who.int](mailto:cuevasl@who.int)  
F Moussy: [moussyf@who.int](mailto:moussyf@who.int)  
Andrew Ramsay: [ramsaya@who.int](mailto:ramsaya@who.int)  
S Swaminathan: [swaminathans@who.int](mailto:swaminathans@who.int)  
Sanne Van Kampen: [vankampens@who.int](mailto:vankampens@who.int)

### **WHO-OTHER**

WHO Guidelines Review Committee Secretariat:  
[grcsecretariat@who](mailto:grcsecretariat@who)

Annex 3 : STAG-TB members

**Mr Faruque Ahmed**

Director, Health Program  
BRAC  
Dhaka  
Bangladesh

**Ms Olayide Akanni**

Executive Director  
Journalists Against AIDS (JAAIDS) in Nigeria  
Abuja  
Nigeria

**Dr Salah Al Awaidy**

Director  
Department of Communicable Disease  
Surveillance & Control  
DGHA, HQ, Ministry of Health  
Muscat  
Oman

**Dr R V Asokan**

RNTCP Project Coordinator  
Indian Medical Association  
Punalur - Kerala  
India

**Dr Kenneth Castro**

Director, Division of TB Elimination  
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention  
Atlanta, GA  
USA

**Dr Jeremiah Muhwa Chakaya**

STAG-TB Chair  
Technical Expert  
National Leprosy and TB Programme  
Ministry of Health  
Nairobi  
Kenya

**Dr Elizabeth Corbett**

Reader in Infectious and Tropical Diseases  
London School of Tropical Medicine & Hygiene  
and MLW Research Programme  
Blantyre  
Malawi

**Prof Francis Drobniowski**

Director, Health Protection Agency  
National Mycobacterium Reference Unit  
Institute for Cell and Molecular Sciences,  
Barts and the London School of Medicine  
London  
United Kingdom

**Dr Wafaa El-Sadr**

Director, CIDER  
Mailman School of Public Health  
Columbia University  
New York, NY  
USA

**Dr Paula I Fujiwara**

Director, Dept of HIV and Senior Advisor  
The Union (Paris, France)  
USA

**Mr Case Gordon**

World Care Council  
Viols en Laval  
France

**Prof Vladimir Malakhov**

National Center for External Quality  
Assessment in Laboratory Testing  
of Russian Federation  
Moscow  
Russia

**Dr Mao Tan Eang**

Advisor to the Minister of Health  
Director, National Center for Tuberculosis and  
Leprosy Control  
Ministry of Health  
Phnom Penh  
Cambodia

**Dr Megan Murray**

Associate Professor of Epidemiology  
Harvard University School of Public Health  
Department of Epidemiology  
Boston, MA  
USA

**Dr Yogan Pillay**

Deputy Director General  
Strategic Health Programmes  
Pretoria  
South Africa

**Dr Minghui Ren**

Director-General  
Department of International Cooperation  
Ministry of Health  
Beijing  
China

**Dr Marieke van der Werf**

Head, Unit Research, Senior Epidemiologist  
KNCV Tuberculosis Foundation  
The Hague  
The Netherlands

**Dr Rajendra Shukla**

Joint Secretary  
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare  
New Delhi  
India

**Dr Pedro Guillermo Suarez**

TB & TB-HIV/AIDS  
Center for Health Services  
Management Sciences for Health  
Arlington, VA USA

**Dr Rosalind G Vianzon**

National TB Programme Manager  
National Center for Disease Control and Prevention  
Department of Health  
Manila  
Philippines

**Prof Wang Longde**

Dean, School of Public Health  
Peking University  
Beijing  
China

**Dr Yuthichai Kasetjaroen**

Director  
Bureau of Tuberculosis  
Ministry of Health  
Bangkok  
Thailand





For further information please contact:

**Stop TB Department**  
World Health Organization  
20 Avenue Appia  
1211 Geneva 27  
Switzerland

Telephone: + 41 22 791 21 11  
Facsimile (fax): + 41 22 791 31 11

Website: <http://www.who.int/topics/tuberculosis/en/>

ISBN 978 92 4 150161 3

